Saskatchewan Assessment Management Agency City/Commercial Advisory Committees

Meeting Minutes for Nov 28, 2024
Sandman Hotel – Great Room 1800 Victoria Avenue East, Regina; or
Virtual Microsoft Teams Meeting

Commercial Advisory Committee

Members Present:

Audrey Trombley – Committee Chair, SAMA Board Member
Randy Goulden, SAMA Board Member, Urban Sector
Jim Angus (non-voting), SAMA Board Member
Myron Knafelc (ex officio), SAMA Board Chair
Noel Geremia, Saskatchewan REALTORS® Association
Linely Shaefer, Saskatchewan Chamber of Commerce
James Taylor, Regina & District Chamber of Commerce
Dawn Schlosser, Building Owners and Managers Association
David Roberts, Western Grain Elevator Association Tax Committee
Brett Van Hereweghe, Pipeline Property Tax Group
Mark Pinney, Canadian Association of Petroleum Producers

Darwin Collins, Saskatchewan Mining Association Corinne Li, Railway Association of Canada

Nancy Wollner, Saskatchewan Assessment Appraisers' Association Grace Muzyka, Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada

Ken Patsula, Public Works and Government Services Canada

Members Absent:

Rod Quintin, SAMA Board Member

Anna Gardikiotis, Regina Downtown Business Improvement District Ed Bobiash, Saskatchewan REALTORS® Association
Tony Playter, Regina & District Chamber of Commerce
Brianna Soberg, Canadian Federation of Independent Business
Ian Magdiak, Canadian Property Tax Association
Jim Bence, Saskatchewan Hotel & Hospitality Association
Cameron Johnson, National Golf Course Owners Association, Saskatchewan Chapter

Monty Reich, Inland Terminal Association of Canada Kirk Wasylik, Pipeline Property Tax Group

City Advisory Committee

Members Present:

Dawn Luhning, Committee Chair, SAMA Board Member Myron Knafelc (ex officio), SAMA Board Chair Maryse Carmichael, City of Moose Jaw James Murdock, City of Moose Jaw Vanessa Vaughan, City of Prince Albert Dawn Kilmer, City of Prince Albert Colinda Johnson, City of Regina Julianne Rempel, City of Swift Current Al Bridal, City of Swift Current Nancy Wollner, Saskatchewan Assessment Appraisers' Association

Members Absent:

John Wagner, (voting), SAMA Board Member
Jason Mancinelli, City of Regina
Bev Dubois, City of Saskatoon
Darren Hill, City of Saskatoon
Jean-Marc Nadeau, Saskatchewan Urban Municipalities Association
Suzanne Zwarych, Saskatchewan School Boards Association

Observers Present:

Abayomi Akintola, Ministry of Government Relations
Alexandra Campbell, Ministry of Trade and Export Development
Colinda Johnson, City of Regina
Bryce Trew, City of Saskatoon
Vanessa Vaughan, City of Prince Albert
Bill Fraser, City of Moose Jaw
Julianne Rempel, City of Swift Current
Betty Rogers, SAMA CEO

Observers Absent:

Chad Boyko, Saskatchewan Municipal Board Carey Baker, Tourism Saskatchewan Siân Pascoe, Canadian Association of Petroleum Producers Blair Cummins, Saskatchewan Association of Rural Municipalities

Guests Present:

Michelle Bley, City of Regina Dami Ogundiwin, Ministry of Government Relations Veniesha Thompson, Ministry of Government Relations Randy Raimbault, SAMA ASD

Guests Absent:

Cole Zawislak, Saskatchewan REALTORS® Association Evan Wilson, Canadian Renewable Energy Association Garry Hammett, SAMA TS&P

Administration Present:

Darwin Kanius, Committee Secretary, SAMA TS&P Todd Treslan, SAMA ASD Rebecca Schultz, SAMA ASD, Industrial Unit Danny Zatylny, SAMA QAD Andrew Workman, SAMA TS&P

Observers Present:

Rod Nasewich, Ministry of Government Relations Bill Fraser, City of Moose Jaw Dale Braitenbach, City of Prince Albert Tanya Mills, City of Regina Bryce Trew, City of Saskatoon Betty Rogers, CEO, SAMA

Observers Absent:

Crystal Froese, Saskatchewan School Boards Association, Trustee Mason Stott, Saskatchewan Urban Municipalities Association, Administration

Vacant, City of Swift Current

Administration Present:

Dallas Pitt, Committee Secretary, SAMA TS&P Shaun Cooney, SAMA TS&P Danny Zatylny, SAMA QAD

Administration Absent:

Kevin Groat, SAMA ASD

SAMA City/Commercial Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes for November 28, 2024

Decision/Resolution: Agenda Item: 1. Call to Order Audrey Trombley, Chair of the Commercial Advisory Committee, called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. 2. Opening Remarks Myron Knafelc, SAMA Board Member, welcomed attendees to the City/Commercial Advisory Committee. 3. Introductions Audrey Trombley opened the floor for in-person attendees to introduce themselves to remote attendees. 4. Approval of the Meeting Agenda Audrey Trombley introduced the agenda. MOTION by Randy Goulden, SAMA Board Member, to approve the agenda. Carried 5. Minutes from the Previous Business Audrey Trombley provided a forum for members to provide feedback on Meeting held March 21, 2024 the previous City/Commercial Advisory Committees joint meeting minutes. No comments or corrections were provided on the meeting minutes. **MOTION** by Grace Muzyka, Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada, that the joint minutes for the March 21, 2024 City and Commercial Advisory Committee's business meeting be adopted as circulated. **Carried** 6. Business Arising from the Minutes of No issues arising from the previous meeting on March 21, 2024. each respective Committee 7. SAMA Update 7a. CEO Report PowerPoint presentation by Betty Rogers, SAMA CEO. Note: PowerPoint presentations and reports will be made available to committee members in SAMACloud. **Comments/Questions** No comments or questions. MOTION by Ken Patsula, Public Works and Government Services Canada, to receive the CEO report. Carried 7b. Assessment Services Division (ASD) PowerPoint presentation by Todd Treslan, SAMA ASD. Report **Comments/Questions**

No comments or questions.

MOTION by Al Bridal, City of Swift Current, to receive the SAMA ASD report.

Carried

7c. Other Assessment Service Provider (ASP) Updates (Saskatoon / Regina / Prince Albert / Swift Current)

City of Saskatoon Update: Verbal presentation by Bryce Trew.

<u>Staffing</u>: Saskatoon had a stable year as it relates to staffing as they only needed to post five jobs, which is a decrease from 2022 and 2023.

<u>2024 Supplemental Rolls</u>: Saskatoon's supplementary assessments have accounted for an increased tax growth of \$4 million this year.

The city typically performs three supplementary rolls per year with one in April, just prior to tax billing, one in July, following tax billing, and one near year end around September/October.

<u>Appeal Update</u>: Saskatoon had 131 appeals to the Board of Revision (BoR) on the 2024 assessment roll.

From these appeals, 17 were updated through an agreement to adjust, 10 resulted in assessment decreases for the property owners, and the remaining appeals were either withdrawn, dismissed by the Board or sustained through Board decision.

At the Saskatchewan Municipal Board (SMB), Saskatoon has 41 appeals for 2024, 179 for 2023 and five from 2022. Most of these appeals are being held in abeyance for Court of Appeal (CoA) decisions.

At the CoA, Saskatoon has had 11 total appeals to this level during this revaluation cycle. From these appeals, six had hearings completed during 2024 with one being remitted back to the SMB, three were rejected on their leave application, and two are still awaiting leave decisions. Saskatoon is waiting for three more appeals to be heard by the CoA.

<u>2025 Revaluation</u>: Saskatoon has finalized their valuation models for the upcoming revaluation and are working to get these models into their Computer Assisted Mass Appraisal (CAMA) system. Additionally, the review of value shifts is underway ahead of releasing information to Saskatoon's council and the public.

Saskatoon is tentatively scheduling their 2025 roll to open on January 27, 2025. A potential risk for opening the roll on time is the ongoing Canada Post strike.

Saskatoon is investigating providing assessment information online ahead of the roll opening in January. Alongside this information, Saskatoon have a taxation shift calculator available, so property owners can view and estimate their property taxes.

For revaluation communication, consultation with property owners in Saskatoon will be continuing in December and early January ahead of opening the assessment roll. Saskatoon will also be advertising information on the revaluation on social media.

Saskatoon will be working on several reports for their council in the coming months. These include an assessment phase-in report which will be presented in February and a report on tax policy and mill rates in March.

City of Saskatoon Update - Comments/Questions

No comments or questions.

<u>City of Regina Update</u>: PowerPoint presentation by Colinda Johnson.

<u>Staffing</u>: Regina has one open position in the assessment department that, due to a budget freeze, is scheduled to be filled in 2025. Additionally, there are several staff retirements occurring in 2025.

Regina has seen a 40% staff turnover since the previous revaluation.

<u>2025 Revaluation</u>: Regina has finalized assessment models for the upcoming revaluation and preliminary values will be available on December 2nd through the city's website. Alongside releasing the information online, Regina will have a media release next Monday and social media advertisements releasing in the coming days.

Like Saskatoon, Regina is planning to open the 2025 assessment roll in mid-January. The Canada Post strike also presents a risk for opening the roll in Regina.

The following are preliminary trends for the upcoming revaluation based upon property type:

- Residential: +7.5%
 - o Vacant Land: +0.36%
 - o Market Area 1: -24%
 - o Market Area 2: -2%
 - o Market Area 3: +1%
 - o Market Area 4: +8%
 - o Market Area 5: +15%
 - Market Area 6: +8%
- <u>Condominiums</u>: -5.0%
 - o High-Rise: -13%
 - o Horizontal: 12%
 - o Loft: -0.25%
 - o Low-Rise: -4%
 - o Townhouse: -11%
- Multi-Residential: -6.0%
 - Vacant Land: -33%
 - o Low-Rise: -15%
 - o High-Rise: -1%
 - o Townhouse: -10%
- <u>Commercial/Industrial</u>: +3.5%
 - o Vacant Land: -16%
 - o Hotels: -18%
 - Auto Dealerships: -21%
 - o Office: +9%
 - o Retail Shopping Center: -35%
 - o Warehouses: +16%
- Overall Shift: +3.6%

Overall, the median assessment to sales ratios (ASR) are at 1.00 for residential properties and 0.99 for commercial properties, which are positive modeling results.

The revenue neutral impacts, based upon the above trending data, will see around 35,000 properties observing a property tax increase at an average of \$630/year, and around 47,000 properties seeing a tax decrease at an average of \$470/yr.

Regina is expecting that most customer service requests will be managed through their website or through phone calls. Regina additionally anticipates more appeals for the 2025 cycle based upon the changes occurring in residential areas.

A risk for the upcoming revaluation includes Regina's unsupported Oracle based CAMA system. Regina has mitigated this risk to the best of their ability.

Appeal Update: The 2019 Southland Mall appeal that was sent down to the SMB for a remittal decision has been reappealed to the CoA. This appeal has been taken forward to the Court of King's Bench (CoKB) on jurisdictional review. The appeal to the CoA is based upon grounds requesting a single fee appraisal for the Cornwall Mall as the appellants feel it is not comparable.

2020 CCRL/Hungerford is back at the CoA regarding vacant industrial land following the SMB deciding in favour of the assessor.

2021 Office & Retail Strip Malls appeals were heard on October 30^{th} and 31^{st} at the CoA. Regina is awaiting the decision that will impact 93 properties.

For 2024, Regina has 162 appeals that have been filed to the SMB. These appeals include 95 industrial, and 11 properties that were appealed by Regina. A BoR decision in 2024 led the Board to raise the value on five properties, Regina has appealed these to the SMB.

For 2023, Regina has 50 appeals that have been filed to the SMB. Currently, five appeals are waiting to be heard and are undergoing case management.

<u>City of Regina Update – Comments/Questions</u>

No comments or questions.

<u>City of Prince Albert Update</u>: Verbal presentation by Vanessa Vaughan.

<u>Staffing</u>: Prince Albert had a staff member resign in August, but are fully staffed again as of November 12th.

<u>Appeal Update</u>: Prince Albert's roll opened on February 1, 2024 and they received 85 appeals. Prince Albert recently received an additional appeal on their supplemental roll in August.

Of those 85 BoR appeals, two were denied, one was withdrawn, nine resulted in an agreement to adjust, and 73 went to a Board hearing. The supplemental appeal is waiting to be scheduled with the BoR.

From those appeals, 14 commercial and 22 condo appeals were filed to the SMB. The 2024 SMB appeals are waiting to be scheduled by the SMB or are being held in abeyance for 2023 CoA or SMB decisions.

For 2023, the CoA granted leave on two appeals. For the SMB, there are nine appeals waiting and undergoing case management.

<u>2025 Revaluation</u>: Prince Albert has completed their modeling and all models are in the CAMA system. A key change from the previous revaluation is that commercial properties will be valued using the income approach.

Prince Albert is currently reviewing the impact of the new models on the population of properties in their system. Therefore, Prince Albert does not have an updated trending information at this time.

Prince Albert will be meeting with city council on December 18th to provide additional background on the rollout of new values in 2025.

For revaluation communication, Prince Albert is planning the release of information on social media and billboards in the city. Additionally, Prince Albert is looking into providing public presentations in each ward on the revaluation changes.

Like other assessment service providers, Prince Albert is planning to open their roll in the middle of January but will be monitoring the Canada Post strike.

<u>City of Prince Albert Update – Comments/Questions</u>

No comments or questions.

City of Swift Current Update: Verbal presentation by Julianne Rempel.

Staffing: Swift Current has an open position for a senior assessor.

<u>Appeal Update</u>: For 2024, Swift Current had 15 appeals. From these appeals, five were withdrawn and 10 were updated through an agreement to adjust.

Swift Current has no appeals at the SMB level.

<u>2025 Revaluation</u>: Swift Current is a bit behind in the modeling process for the upcoming revaluation but have been fortunate to hire assessment consultants to assist with the modeling process. Currently, the residential and multi-residential models have been completed and work is continuing on the commercial model.

Swift Current does not have an update for 2025 assessment trends at this time. Swift Current will also be monitoring the Canada Post strike for the approaching revaluation.

<u>Other Projects</u>: Swift Current's CAMA system is also outdated, so they have begun the process of reviewing potential upgrades to their system with their IT department.

<u>City of Swift Current Update – Comments/Questions</u>

No comments or questions.

MOTION by Grace Muzyka, Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada, to receive the verbal ASP reports.

Carried

7d. Assessment Governance Report

PowerPoint presentation by Shaun Cooney, SAMA TS&P

Comments/Questions

No comments or questions.

MOTION by Ken Patsula, Public Works and Government Services to receive the Assessment Governance report.

Carried

8. Assessment Appeals Update

8a. Assessment Appeals and Court of Appeal Update

PowerPoint presentation by Darwin Kanius, SAMA TS&P.

Court of Appeal and Court of King's Bench decisions discussed during this presentation can be accessed at www.canlii.org/en/sk.

Comments/Questions

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: Can additional background be provided on the impact of appeal delays on the assessment system? For example, on appeals that go back and forth between the SMB, CoA and CoKB.

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: These type of appeals can complicate the system due to decisions potentially being rendered following the creation of new assessment models for a subsequent revaluation.

Additionally, these appeals may hold up decisions in future years due to appeals being held in abeyance until the precedent setting decision has been finalized.

<u>City of Swift Current</u>: For the elevator appeal with three different decisions, did this happen with multiple Boards?

SAMA Administration: These decisions came from three different Boards in three different municipalities on the same type of property that was valued with the same model. The various levels of experience with Board members can pose issues should a specific panel not be well-versed on a type of property.

MOTION by Al Bridal, City of Swift Current, to receive the Assessment Appeals report.

Carried

- 9. Revaluation and Policy Developments
- 9a. Oil and Gas Site Land Valuation Issue

PowerPoint presentation by Andrew Workman, SAMA TS&P

Comments/Questions

<u>Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada</u>: Has SAMA begun collecting leased land information?

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: SAMA's Industrial Unit has begun reaching out to oil and gas and pipeline companies to receive leased land information for the proposed policy.

SAMA has requested the data ahead of receiving Ministerial approval to ensure, should approval be provided, that SAMA appraisers have enough time to implement updates to the land assessment for the 2025 revaluation.

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: SAMA would like to thank all stakeholders who took part in the Treatment of Oil and Gas Land review process.

If the policy is approved by the Ministry of Government Relations, SAMA is recommending implementation in 2025 because the revenue neutral goal for municipalities should help mitigate assessment increases. This is based upon industrial values increasing with other property types at the same time.

<u>City of Swift Current</u>: Swift Current has had an interesting situation with abandoned oil wells that are within new subdivisions of the city. Swift Current has reached out to the provincial government but has been unable to get any additional data on if they have been properly reclaimed/abandoned.

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: The Ministry of Energy and Resources should have additional information. From SAMA's information, most urban oil and gas wells have been shut in.

MOTION by Grace Muzyka, Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada, to receive the Oil and Gas Land Site Valuation Issue report.

Carried

Lunch Break

9b. 2025 Revaluation

1. Assessment Trends

12:07 pm to 12:52 pm

PowerPoint presentation by Andrew Workman, SAMA TS&P

Comments/Questions

No comments or questions.

MOTION by Al Bridal, City of Swift Current, to receive the 2025 Revaluation Assessment Trends report.

Carried

2. Quality Coordination Program

PowerPoint presentation by Darwin Kanius, SAMA TS&P

Comments/Questions

No comments or questions.

MOTION by Julianne Rempel, City of Swift Current, to receive the 2025 Revaluation Quality Coordination report.

Carried

9c. 2029 Revaluation Preparations

PowerPoint presentation by Andrew Workman, SAMA TS&P

Comments/Questions

<u>Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada</u>: Does SAMA use other Marshall & Swift (M&S) codes for strip malls? How are steel framed malls currently assessed?

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: Currently, steel framed strip malls are valued using the M&S masonry or wood frame model codes. The review is looking to add the steel frame MS-412 M&S code into our CAMA system.

<u>SAMA Board Member</u>: Could SAMA implement irrigation into the existing productivity model?

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: That is planned to be investigated during the irrigation review. SAMA previously had an irrigation adjustment within the model in the 1980's, but this was recommended to be removed by previous stakeholders.

The irrigation review will allow SAMA to have a fresh look at the model and see if an irrigation adjustment is warranted.

<u>City of Swift Current</u>: Could Saskatchewan follow a similar approach to Alberta where the pivot and water rights are included with the value of the land?

SAMA Administration: Those areas are included within the sale price of land in Alberta, but the assessed value of agricultural land in Alberta has remained around \$350/acre for several years, so any adjustment within their model would be negligible in relation to ag land values in Saskatchewan. Additionally, they value some pieces of the irrigation equipment.

MOTION by Al Bridal, City of Swift Current, to receive the 2029 Revaluation Preparations report.

Carried

10. Future Developments10a. Provincial Assessment SystemReview by International Property TaxInstitute (IPTI)

PowerPoint presentation by Shaun Cooney, SAMA TS&P

Comments/Questions

<u>Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada</u>: It is disappointing to see that only two of the eight options for change are being further considered.

For example, the change to true market values and the system being leveraged against property owners are items that could be considered further.

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: This review of the recommendation was conducted under SUMA's guidance and there are items continuing to be reviewed such as changes to the appeal system.

The rationale for not further considering the shift to true market values for all property in Saskatchewan, including regulated property, was mainly based upon resource considerations for ASPs. If ASPs had the resources to facilitate a true market system, this would be an option that could be considered again in the future. There are also practical considerations, such as the inability to value properties for mass appraisal purposes that do not frequently sell, such as mines, using the Market Valuation Standard.

The recommendations for the appeal system, such as one appeal per cycle, are not meant to take away anyone's right to appeal. Everyone can still appeal. Instead this is meant to address a very limited number of high value and complex property types that are being appealed in all four years of the cycle on the same grounds in an attempt to lower taxes, versus determining the correct assessment. Reducing these limited but redundant appeals will improve the efficiency of the appeal system, reduce costs for stakeholders, and free up assessment appraisers to focus on valuations and improved quality.

The ability to appeal and maintaining transparency are key aspects of the assessment system and should be improved as part of this overall review of the assessment system.

<u>SAMA Board Member</u>: SUMA welcomes any additional feedback you would like to provide on the IPTI options for change. Any stakeholders that wish to do so are recommended to contact Jean-Marc Nadeau, SUMA CEO.

The review of the options for change recommended by IPTI is the first step in the process of making improvements to the assessment system. There will be further investigation into the options for change through SUMA working with SAMA and the provincial government.

<u>City of Swift Current</u>: The items that have been taken forward were determined through voting by SUMA's IPTI Working Group. This is the first step and, hopefully, additionally items can be investigated again in the future such as making appeals easier for mom and pop residential and small business appeals.

The provincial government will be the main driver behind implementing the four recommendations that have been brought forward.

MOTION by Julianne Rempel, City of Swift Current, to receive the IPTI Update report.

Carried

10b. City Assessor/SAMA Committee – Legislation Recommendations for Municipal Acts PowerPoint presentation by Randy Raimbault, SAMA ASD.

Comments/Questions

Saskatchewan Association of the Appraisal Institute of Canada: Regarding the recommendations to provide ASPs a three-day window to cross appeal and that written correspondence be agreed upon to resolve an appeal before the hearing, these appear to be restrictive on property owners.

For instance, the assessor has 24 months to review the material ahead of the roll opening and the property owner only has 30/60 days to review the material after the roll opens to determine if they want to appeal.

These recommendations would further tighten the timeline or provide additional benefits to the assessor. From our perspective, property owners would view these recommendations as unfair.

<u>SAMA Administration</u>: Thank you for the comments. The three-day window to allow for cross appeals was brought forward to address circumstances where ASPs receive numerous appeals during the final hours ahead of the notice of appeal deadline.

This would allow the respondent the ability to review the grounds and cross appeal only on an as needed basis.

MOTION by Julianne Rempel, City of Swift Current, to receive the City Assessor/SAMA Committee Legislation Recommendations report.

Carried

11. Other Business

11a. Next City and Commercial Advisory Committee Meeting

The next City and Commercial Advisory Committee meeting is currently scheduled for March 27, 2025.

MOTION by Julianne Rempel, City of Swift Current, to adjourn the meeting at 2:16 pm.

Carried

Darwin Kanius

Commercial Advisory Committee, Secretary

Dallas Pitt

City Advisory Committee, Secretary

Dallas Pitt